

Institute for Economic and Social Reforms

Fiscal decentralization and transparency of municipalities in Slovakia

Peter Golias INEKO Director May 28th, 2015 Chisinau, Moldova Seminar on "Financial health of municipalities from Moldova using Slovak experience"

Government expenditure



Source: OECD

Funding of local governments

| 2015 revenues | Municipalities (2926 towns, town districts, and villages) | Higher Territorial Units (8 HTUs) | Total |
|------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-------|
| In EUR million | 4,044 | 1,254 | 5,298 |
| In % of state budget revenues | 27.9% | 8.7% | 36.6% |
| In % of public finance revenues | 14.2% | 4.4% | 18.6% |
| In % of GDP | 5.2% | 1.6% | 6.8% |

Financing principles

- Original competencies to be financed from <u>tax</u> revenues depending on real tax collection and/or hard data (number of citizens & pupils, etc.)
- Transferred competencies to be financed from state budget transfers depending on hard data (number of citizens & pupils, etc.)
- Other mostly one-off needs to be financed from grants based on a request for financing (projects)
 - Regional development, environment
 - Building industrial parks, etc.

Competencies

- Original
 - Education: Primary arts schools, language schools, pre-primary schools, school facilities (dormitories, clubs, canteens, etc.)
 - Transport: Intra-city (municipalities); inter-city (HTUs)
 - Care services (munic.), social affairs (homes for pensioners) & culture (HTUs)
 - 2nd and 3rd class roads (HTUs)
 - Communal waste disposal, etc.
- Transferred
 - Education: Primary schools (municipalities), secondary schools (HTUs)
 - Health care: Regional hospitals, polyclinics, health centers (HTUs)
 - Construction permits (municipalities)
 - Citizens' registration offices (municipalities), etc.

Revenues of municipalities

| | 2015 (EUR million) | 2015 (%) | |
|--|--------------------|----------|--|
| Tax revenues | 1,954 | 48% | |
| - Share on personal income tax revenues | 1,442 | 36% | |
| - Real estate taxes | 327 | 8% | |
| Other local taxes and fees (e.g. tax on dogs, fees for waste disposal, etc.) | 185 | 5% | |
| Non-tax revenues | 573 | 14% | |
| - Business activities, rent | 156 | 4% | |
| - Administrative and other fees | 253 | 6% | |
| - Sale of capital (land, buildings, etc.) | 80 | 2% | |
| - Other (e.g. interest on deposits) | 84 | 2% | |
| Grants and transfers | 1,177 | 29% | |
| Other (transfers from previous years, loans, etc.) | 340 | 8% | |
| Total | 4,044 | 100% | |

Revenues of municipalities

| | 2015 (EUR million) | 2015 (%) |
|---|-------------------------|----------|
| Tax revenues | 1,954 | 48% |
| Non-tax revenues | 573 | 14% |
| Grants and transfers | 1,177 | 29% |
| - Subsidies to fund primary schools | 679 | 17% |
| Subsidies to (co)fund Eurofunds projects (Environment + Regional development + Business subsidies + Education) | 344 (=183+116+29+16) | 9% |
| - Subsidies to fund social policies | 54 | 1% |
| Other (Environment Fund, Subsidy to fund flats restitution, Subsidies to fund Registry and other offices, etc.) | 100 | 2% |
| Other (transfers from previous years, loans, etc.) | 340 | 8% |
| Total | 4,044 | 100% |
| | | |

Revenues of 8 HTUs

| | 2015 (EUR million) | 2015 (%) |
|--|------------------------------|----------|
| Tax revenues | 625 | 50% |
| - Share on personal income tax revenues | 614 (up from 426 in 2014) | 49% |
| - Tax on motor vehicles | 12 (down from 147) | 1% |
| Non-tax revenues | 123 | 10% |
| - Business activities, rent, interest on deposits | 9 | 0.7% |
| - Administrative and other fees | 80 | 6% |
| - Sale of capital (land, buildings, etc.) | 8 | 0.6% |
| - Other | 26 | 2% |
| Grants and transfers | 421 | 34% |
| Other (transfers from previous years, loans, etc.) | 85 | 7% |
| Total | 1,254 | 100% |

Revenues of 8 HTUs

| | 2015 (EUR million) | 2015 (%) |
|---|--------------------|----------|
| Tax revenues | 625 | 50% |
| Non-tax revenues | 123 | 10% |
| Grants and transfers | 421 | 34% |
| - Subsidies to fund secondary schools | 412 | 33% |
| Subsidies to (co)fund Eurofunds projects (Education) | 7 | 0.6% |
| - Subsidies to fund emergency repair of schools | 3 | 0.2% |
| Other (transfers from previous years, loans, etc.) | 85 | 7% |
| Total | 1,254 | 100% |

Financial balance

EUR million



Financial balance - Municipalities Financial balance - HTUs

Division of PIT

- Municipalities' share on personal income tax revenues:
 - 2011: 70.3%
 - 2012: 65.4% (fiscal consolidation)
 - 2013: 65.4%
 - 2014: 67.0%
 - 2015: 68.5% (EUR1.44 billion)
 - 2016: 70.3% (EUR1.54 billion)
- HTUs' share on personal income tax revenues:
 - Until 2014: 21.9%
 - 2015: 29.2% (compensation for diverting revenues from tax on motor vehicles from HTU to state budget)

Computing PIT revenues

| Criteria | Share on total revenues | | | | | |
|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| Municipalities | | | | | | |
| Number of citizens | 23% (57% is adjusted for the munic. altitude) | | | | | |
| Number of citizens adjusted for the size | 32% | | | | | |
| Number of pupils | 40% | | | | | |
| Number of citizens of the age 62+ | 5% | | | | | |
| HTUs | | | | | | |
| Number of citizens | 15% | | | | | |
| Number of citizens of the age 15-18 | 15% | | | | | |
| Number of citizens of the age 62+ | 32% | | | | | |
| Population density | 9% | | | | | |
| Length of 2nd and 3rd class roads | 20% | | | | | |
| Surface area | 9% | | | | | |

... plus special coeficients for HTUs and school facilities

Further reforms?

- Reducing the number of municipalities?
 - Slovakia: 2926 municipalities (including 17 districts in Bratislava and 22 districts in Košice)
 - Two thirds below 1000 citizens
 - Finland: 320 municipalities, plan to decrease to 100 (just like in Denmark)
- In/de-creasing the tax-collection independence?
 - 2015: Diverting revenues from tax on motor vehicles from HTUs to state budget
 - December 2015: Introduction of limits on taxes for agricultural (1.25%) and forest (2.5%) land

Transparency

- 2000: Freedom of Information Act
- 2011: All contracts, invoices and orders have to be published on internet, otherwise contracts are not valid
- "Open municipality" project run by Transparency International Slovakia monitors above-the-law transparency:
 - Computing transparency rating for 100 biggest municipalities based on a set of 102 indicators grouped in following areas:
 - Access to information (documents from city board meetings, information about board members, evidence of dogs, etc.)
 - Public participation in decision making
 - Public procurement; Sale and rent of property
 - Budget; Grants & Subsidies; Flats & Social facilities
 - Human resource management
 - Ethics & Conflicts of interests (incl. accessibility of property declarations)
 - Land planning & Construction authority; Firms co-owned by municipality

Financial transparency

 INEKO portal computing financial health of all municipalities and HTUs (to be transferred to Moldova): <u>http://www.obce.ineko.sk/</u>

Problems

- Weak control & violation of law
 - Unpublished contracts (especially in small villages)
 - 5% of mayors active in business, etc.
- Low above-the-law transparency:
 - Average "Open municipality" rating in 2014: 47 points of 100; the best city: 72; the worst: 23
 - The worst results in sale and rent of property
 - Minimum accessibility of <u>property declarations</u> of both mayors and deputies
- Hidden debts: PPP projects, subsidiaries

Project in Moldova

- Title: Improving Oversight of Local Governments in Moldova
- Supported by the National Endowment for Democracy (NED)
- Timeframe: May 2015 January 2016
- Partners: INEKO & IDIS
- Goal: To increase the financial accountability of local governments in 50 municipalities in Moldova
- Tools:
 - Transfer of INEKO knowledge on computing financial health of municipalities
 - Creating a portal/dataset of financial indicators of at least 50 Moldovan biggest cities

Activities

- May 2015:
 - Opening seminar
- May June 2015:
 - Data identification
 - Creating a methodology for assessing the financial health of local governments in Moldova
- July September 2015:
 - Data collection and processing
 - Creating the dataset/portal
- November 2015 January 2016:
 - Analysis of the financial health of the biggest towns and municipalities of Moldova
- January 2016:
 - Seminar and press conference in *Chişinău;* project conclusion

INEKO portal

Main page:



HOSPODÁRENIE VYŠŠÍCH ÚZEMNOSPRÁVNYCH CELKOV (VÚC)



INEKO portal

Profiles of municipalities and HTUs:

| Úvod Údaje o hospodárení I | Vástroje Viac o projekte | | | | Recommend |
|--|--|--------------------|--|---|--|
| Kysucké Nové Mesto | | | | | |
| 2006 2007 2008 2009 2010 | 2011 2012 2013 | | | | |
| HODNOTENIE FINANČNÉHO ZDRAVIA | (2010 - 2013) | | | ZÁKLADNÉ ÚDA. | JE |
| CELKOVÉ FINANČNÉ ZDRAVIE () 5,6 / 6 VÝBORNÉ FINANČNÉ ZDRAVIE (* | ZLOŽKY FINANČNÉHO ZDRAVIA Základná bilancia i Dlhová služba i Celkový dlh i Záväzky aspoň 60 dní po splatnosti i Okamžitá likvidita i | **** | 4,0 5,8 6,0 6,0 6,0 6,0 | Počet obyvateľov: Okres: Kraj: E-mail: | mesto 16 264 Kysucké Nové Mesto Žilinský primator@kysuckenovemesto.s Zakopane Zakopane Košice lovensko |
| HLAVNÉ INDIKÁTORY (2013) | | | priemer obcí SR | en Bratislava | Idapest Debrecer |
| Základná bilancia | 3,1 % | datat atata | 3,0 % | Map data ©2 | Idapest Debrecen 0150GeoBasis-DE/BKG (©2009) |
| + Dlhová služba | 0,6 % | <i>kikkik</i> | 6,5 % | HOSPODÁRENIE | NAJBLIŽŠÍCH OBCÍ |
| 🛨 Celkový dlh | 0,0 % | kikikik | 25,0 % | | |
| 🛨 Záväzky aspoň 60 dní po splatnosti | 0,0 % | kikikik | 0,7 % | 1 Radoľa | **** |
| + Okamžitá likvidita | 588,5 % | kkkkk | 141,7 % | 2 Povina | shirker |
| | | | | 3 Rudinka | *** |

používateľ: petergolias

INEKO portal

| | μοορορίρενμε μμεστιοροί μινώσ | | | | | | | používateľ: petergolias | |
|-----------|--|-----|---|--------------|-------------------------------|-------------|----------|-------------------------|-------------|
| Financial | HOSPODÁRENIE MIEST, OBCÍ A VÚC | | | PODPORTE NÁS | | INEKO | | Profil | Odhlásiť sa |
| health | Úvod Údaje o hospodárení Nástroje | e V | iac o projekte | | | | | F Recon | nmend 449 |
| rankings: | | | | | | | | | |
| _ | SAMOSPRÁVY | | | Celkové | | | | Záväzky aspoň 60 | |
| | VÚC | | | finančné | Základná | Dihová | Celkový | dní po | Okamžitá |
| | 💟 mestá | | samospráva 🔷 | zdravie | bilancia \Leftrightarrow | služba ¢ | dlh ≑ | splatnosti 🔶 | likvidita |
| | obce | 1 | Kysucké Nové Mesto Žilinský kraj | ***** | **** | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| | FINANČNÉ ZDRAVIE | 2 | Strážske | ***** | **** | ***** | **** | ****** | **** |
| | Celkové finančné zdravie i | - | okres Michalovce, kraj: KE | 000000 | | | | | |
| | Základná bilancia i | 3 | Nová Baňa | ***** | *** | **** | ****** | ****** | ***** |
| | Dlhová služba i | - | okres Žarnovica, kraj: BB | | | | | | |
| | 🔽 Celkový dlh 🥫 | 4 | | **** | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| | 🛛 Záväzky aspoň 60 dní po splatnosti i | | okres Hlohovec, kraj: TT | | | | | | |
| | Økamžitá likvidita i | 5 | Svätý Jur okres Pezinok, kraj: BA | ***** | toto lolok | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| | ROK | 6 | Topoľčany | | | ***** | ****** | ****** | |
| | 2013 💌 | _ | Nitriansky kraj | | | | | | |
| | | 7 | Hlohovec Trnavský kraj | **** | *** | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| | ĎALŠIE NASTAVENIA REBRÍČKA | | Trnavský kraj | | | | | | |
| | Ďalšie ukazovatele o hospodárení | 8 | Modra okres Pezinok, kraj: BA | ***** | Adab iolok | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| | Špecifický výber okresov a krajov | 9 | Poprad Prešovský kraj | **** | kakak alalak | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| | ☑ Ukotviť tento panel | 10 | Sereď okres Galanta, kraj: TT | **** | Arto lohilok | ***** | ***** | ***** | ***** |
| | | | | | | | | | |

Financial health indicators

| Indicators entering final rating | Weight |
|---|--------|
| Overall debt over current revenues | 2 |
| Debt service (interest plus principle) over current revenues | 1 |
| Current and capital account balance over current and capital revenues | 1 |
| Liabilities overdue at least 60 days over current revenues | 1 |
| Immediate liquidity on financial accounts over short-term liabilities | 1 |

- All indicators are transformed to the scale {0, 6}
- Overall debt is computed based on data from the most recent year
- Other four indicators are computed based on data from the 4 most recent years with following weights:
 - Year t: 4
 - Year t-1: 3
 - Year t-2: 2
 - Year t-1: 1

Underlying data

- 1. Current account revenues
- 2. Current account expenditures
- 3. Capital account revenues
- 4. Capital account expenditures
- 5. Debt service principal
- 6. Debt service interest
- 7. Short-term liabilities
- 8. Long-term liabilities
- 9. Bank loans
- 10. Loans from the state
- 11. Overdue liabilities
- 12. Liabilities overdue at least 60 days
- 13. Short-term receivables
- 14. Financial assets (e.g. cash, bank deposits)
- 15. Number of citizens

Thank you for your attention!

http://ineko.sk/; http://www.obce.ineko.sk/